

ESSN Task Force Istanbul Minutes

Objective	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Welcome and introduction 2. Action points from the previous meeting 3. Updates on the ESSN and its implementation in Marmara region <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - TRC Data Management and Analysis System 4. Updates on the CCTE 5. ESSN and Disability 6. Q&A with MoH 7. AOB
------------------	--

Date of meeting	11 February 2019 09:30 - 11:30	Location	TRC Area Office - Zafer Mah. Çınar Sok. No: 1 Kat:1 A5 Adapark Plaza (Yenibosna) Bahçelievler / Istanbul
		Meeting Co-Chairs	WFP: Arzum Karasu TRC: Hanifi Kinaci

1. Action points:

Follow up issue:	Who will take action:	Deadline:
Share statistics of actions taken and results obtained after identification of school dropping or cases of children not registered at school	TRC CCTE	April ESSN Task Force

2. Updates on the ESSN:

- The Co-Chairs World Food Programme (WFP) and Turkish Red Crescent (TRC) provided an update on the ESSN to date noting that as of 4 February 2019, a total of 504,554 applications (2,563,668 people) were registered; 2,471 applications were not assessed; 268,812 applications were deemed eligible and 233,271 applications were ineligible. 36.50% of the applications were registered by TRC Service Centres.
- 262,832 households (1,567,179 people) in total received ESSN assistance in January.
- 36,533 households (214,611 people) in Istanbul received the ESSN assistance.
- As of 10th of January, 1,299 accounts were swept back nationwide: 634 uncollected cards (+3 months), 665 dormant accounts (+6 months).

■ Focus Group Discussions findings:

The highlights of the January Focus Group Discussion (FGDs) findings were presented. The FGD investigated livelihoods and social cohesion related topics.

▪ Highlights:

○ Livelihoods:

- Job opportunities are **far fewer** than when they first arrived.

11 February 2019, 09:30-11:30, WFP/TRC Istanbul

- Female participants reported no change concerning their use of the assistance (covering rent and bills).
- Male participants reported improvement in their lives after receiving the assistance.
- **Social Cohesion:**
 - No tension with the host community was raised. Female participants noted that the Turkish people were very helpful during the first years but **that it was no longer the case**.
 - Male participants reported **no change with their interactions** with the host communities.

■ **TRC-WFP Monitoring and Evaluation Activities:**

Monitoring visits were conducted in seven provinces (Istanbul, Kocaeli, Edirne, Canakkale, Kutayha, Bursa and Tekirdag) to Hospitals, Halkbank branches, DGPC (Nufus) and SASFs.

■ **Highlights:**

- Hospitals: Most of the hospitals visited indicated that Disability Health Report related applications number has stabilised.
- SASFs: The majority of the SASFs visited stated that they don't have enough monitors for household visits. They also mentioned that applications with ID being registered at different province continue to increase.

■ **TRC Outreach Activities:**

During January, TRC Istanbul Outreach Teams have visited 54 sites in six provinces.

■ **Highlights:**

- Halkbank: 15 cards delivery problems were detected in different provinces due to name-surname discrepancies following ID updating process. TRC Transfer Management Team and Halkbank officials were informed.
- SASFs: In Esenyurt, an applicant's false registry to the Social Security institution on the Integrated Social Assistance Information System (ISAIS) hindered his application to the KIZILAYKART. After updating his profile on the ISAIS, the problem was fixed, and his application was submitted to the SASF Board of Trustees.

■ **TRC Data Management and Analysis System**

Turkish Red Crescent made a presentation on their database and analysis system. The presentation included information on ESSN's 2.5 million application pool and how this data is being used for further analysis and programmatic decisions. As an example of conducted analysis on the use of ESSN's existing application pool, livelihood survey findings including educational background, difficulties faced in finding a job and capacities of beneficiaries were shared with participants. More details are available in attached presentation.

3. Updates on the CCTE:

- Starting from December 2018, 2nd and 6th grade students have been prioritized in CCTE house visits since according to the November frozen list, 2nd and 6th grade students were higher in number. 11680 students of 6th grade missed more than 4 days of school while this number is 14705 for 2nd grade.

11 February 2019, 09:30-11:30, WFP/TRC Istanbul

- As of 31st of January;
 - 53,561 children were screened by outreach teams.
 - 9823 children were identified and assessed with protection needs.
 - 4 853 children were referred to specialized services.
 - Konya has highest number of screened children with 5 431.
 - %51 of the screened children (27,213) were boys and %49 of them (26,348) were girls.
 - 42,973 children had been under no risk while 3 322 of them had high risk level.
- In the November-December period, Bağcılar child protection team screened 296 children and none of them were identified with high risk level. 592 children were screened by Sultanbeyli child protection team and 11 of them had high risk level.

Cash Component:

- UNICEF CCTE Field Monitor provided an update noting that 439,215 beneficiaries were entitled for CCTE payment in January 2019 and 47,563 beneficiaries received only CCTE top-up payment. 211,038 Kizilaycards were uploaded with January 2019 payment. 1,526,911 Turkish beneficiaries received January 2019 payment in the national CCTE programme.
- As of January 2019 payment, the number of children reached with at least one CCTE payment has become 487,089 and the number of Kizilaycards uploaded with January CCTE payment is of 236,218.
- As of 21 January 2019, 91 % (462,243) of the CCTE applications were accepted, 8 % (43,912) of the applications were rejected and 1 % (3,341) of the applications is pending. 36 % of the applications were registered by TRC Service Centres.
- As of 16 January, 98,569 calls were received by TRC Call Center for CCTE. 56 % of the callers were women and top call category was related to information request.
- 14 % of the CCTE beneficiaries (69.183), who were entitled for CCTE payment in January, are registered in Istanbul which keeps its seat as the province with most CCTE beneficiaries in Turkey. Among 69,183 beneficiaries, 1 % of the students are in kindergarten level, 6 % of the students are in high-school level and 93 % of the students are in primary school. 5 districts with most beneficiaries in Istanbul are respectively as follows: Esenyurt (11 %), Bagcilar (9 %), Sultangazi (8%), Kucukcekmece (8%) and Esenler (7 %).
- **14 SASFs, 2 Halkbank branch and 1 CSO** were visited in **four provinces** in the Marmara and the Aegean Regions since 10 December, 2018.
 - Refugee movement for work, especially due to animal husbandry and agriculture, is still prevalent in Marmara region creating challenges in confirming address and conducting verification visits.
 - In Kaynarca, Sakarya, it was observed that for those who have left camps voluntarily, the SASF does not create file / provide services if refugees don't have a letter about their voluntary departure from the camp or a previous residency in another province.
 - In Pamukova, Sakarya, the SASF has rejected some of the CCTE beneficiaries because they opened businesses.
 - In Çorlu, Tekirdağ, the SASF observed inadequate communication by ESSN and CCTE programmes on the sources of funding for the cash transfers (both CCTE and ESSN) for refugees, leaving SASFs in a difficult position to deal with local tensions. (It was noted that UNICEF is working on Communication for Development Strategy to reach and better inform refugee and host community members on different levels about details of the CCTE programme including but not limited to its funding side).
- Children enrolled in ALP have been eligible to apply for the CCTE programme as of mid-August 2018.
 - The number of ALP Learners in Istanbul was 361 among the 314,763 children paid in November 2018, and 885 among the 439,215 in January 2019.

There are 13 districts in Istanbul where ALP classes are operational: Arnavutkoy, Avcilar, Esenyurt, Kucukcekmece, Sultangazi, Bahcelievler, Basaksehir, Bayrampasa, Beykoz, Kagithane, Pendik, Sisli, Zeytinburnu.

4. ESSN and Disability

- The presentation included the legal framework under which the Ministry of Health operated when putting in place policies for people with disabilities, for their status, their rights and for the Severe Disability Assistance which can be claimed according to individual situations and the procedure for obtaining Disability Health Reports in Turkey.
- The Severe Disability Assistance and the disability criteria when applying to the ESSN programme was discussed. Regarding the Severe Disability Assistance, one of the criteria to obtain such a report is to have at least 50% disability however to avoid confusion, the representative of the MoH have stressed the fact that **having 50% disability does not automatically mean that the applicant is severely disabled.**
- Severe Disability Assistance started in August 2018 and can only be provided to ESSN beneficiaries.
- 5.928 people have been granted severe disabled assistance as of December 2018. These are located in 71 provinces.

5. Q&A with Representative from MoH: M. Zubeyir UNSAL and M. Ali BATGA

- Representatives of the MoH shared their own presentation on the policy of the Ministry of Health regarding the rights of people with disabilities as well as the legal framework and its implementation. The presentation included a map with the location (nationwide) of the hospital where the DHR can be obtained (private, publics and university training hospitals) – the link of the map and the list of those places has also been shared: https://khgmozellikli.saglik.gov.tr/svg/ozellikli_hizmetler.php?srr=136
- Representatives answered questions and comments about some issues raised by participants mainly relating to the difficulties of access to some treatment and/or medicines for refugees. M. Ali Batga reminded the participants that some medicine is originally not available in Turkey, as they are coming from abroad – The Ministry has asked DGMM to finance some imported medicines, so they can be accessible to refugees. The representatives also reminded participants of the fact that the National Security Scheme (SGK) does not provide medicine to refugees whereas AFAD used to hence their request to the DGMM who is now taking over from AFAD.
- Regarding the possibility of appeal, the representatives reminded participants that the Provincial Health Directorate to whom the hospital is attached, is the legitimate entity to which people should go should they have objections to the result of the report. As for the complaints, these must be directed to the MoH hotline 184. **For the appeals, it was noted that there is no deadline.**
- During the presentation, a referral letter from the SASFs were mentioned, stating that applicants to the DHR could provide a referral letter from the SASFs to the hospitals. The representatives added that when an SASF provide a referral letter then the report must contain three pages (one for the hospital, one for the applicant and the third one for the SASF) and if not, the report is made of two pages only.
- Regarding the Disability Health Report fees, the representatives reminded participants that DHRs are not free, the cost that should be applied is 200 TL adding that an agreement between the Ministry of Health and the DGMM is being discussed to provide it for free.

- Ministry of Health has recently launched an audit process in 71 provinces to control, identify and complete all technical infrastructure, capacity and other technological requirements.
- Based on the MoH database online platform, MoH can have access to data on DHR numbers and disabled individuals number, as of the end of 2018, there are 6 million DHR reports registered in the system and almost 3,5 million disabled individuals are registered.
- To check all kinds of medical reports provided by public hospitals, there is a platform called e-rapor platform. This platform enables the Ministry to measure the satisfaction of patients who own a DHR report.
- The representatives also mentioned that all refugees have access to medical examination in polyclinics free of charge and that disabled patients have prioritization in hospitals in terms of access.

6. Any Other Businesses:

- CCTE teams have faced cases in Kaynarca, Sakarya where some refugees registering in a province after his departure from a camp were told by the local SASFs that no services could be provided if they don't provide a letter stipulating whether their departure from the camp was known to the authorities. After cross checking with TRC, this can be confirmed. **When a family/person leaves any camp, the camp management must give a letter acknowledging the departure, if the family/person cannot provide such document, it can be interpreted as an illegal departure from the camp and hence no registration and/or services can be provided.**
- **New cycle of meeting:** Participants have been presented with the results of the survey that aimed at collecting their opinions on the new meeting format. The majority of those who participated at the survey have opted for the ESSN TF to take place on a **bi-monthly basis, on the second Tuesday morning** of the month. The ESSN TF will still be followed by the BN WG. The next ESSN TF meeting will therefore take place in April.
- Please remember to send any issues/challenges observed with as much detail as possible (location, date, etc.) to the ESSN TF focal points:
 - **WFP:** Arzum Karasu – email: arzum.karasu@wfp.com
 - **TRC:**
 - Ayman Sallawy Alhalb – email: ayman.alhalb@kizilay.org.tr
 - Hanifi Kinaci – email: hanifi.kinaci@kizilay.org.tr
- For any programmatic issues, please refer your queries to the following Programme related focal points:
 - **WFP:**
 - Verda Yuceer – email: verda.yuceer@wfp.org.com
 - Abdullah Alani – email: abdullah.alani@wfp.org
 - **TRC:** Faruk Ahmed Abdo Shaban – email: faruk.shaban@kizilay.org.tr

Next Meeting: The next meeting will be held on 9 April. The venue, time and agenda will be shared accordingly.

Attachments:

1. ESSN Task Force Istanbul Presentation
2. TRC Data Management and Analysis System
3. ESSN and Disability presentation
4. CTE presentation