Nationality and Statelessness in the Great Lakes Region

Bronwen Manby

Regional Ministerial Conference Nairobi, 16-18 April 2019

The importance of statelessness

- >A human rights issue
- > A humanitarian issue
- ➤ A development issue
- > A peace and security issue

Terminology: nationality and citizenship

- Nationality and citizenship are synonyms in international law
- ➤ In international law, "nationality" is the term more commonly used (in both French and English)
- ➤ At national level, "citizenship" more commonly used in the common law countries; "nationality" (nationalité) in civil law
- In *non-legal* usage, "nationality" sometimes implies an ethnic component, "citizenship" the participatory aspects

Nationality in national laws

- > Attribution by operation of law (nationalité d'origine)
 - ➤ Birth in the territory (*jus soli*)
 - * Beware of the confusion relating to "citizenship by birth" in English
 - ➤ Double jus soli (born + one parent also born in the territory)
 - ➤ One parent (or grandparent) who is a citizen (*jus sanguinis*)
 - Presumption for unknown parents / stateless
- > Acquisition on application
 - ➤ Delayed *jus soli* (birth + residence during childhood)
 - ➤ Adoption (may also be in family code)
 - ➤ Marriage (automatic, option, registration)
 - ➤ Long residence (naturalisation / registration)

Who is a stateless person?



Stateless person: a person who is "not considered as a national by any State under the operation of its law"

« une personne qu'aucun État ne considère comme son ressortissant par application de sa législation »

(Art 1, Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons, 1954)

UNHCR: a "mixed question of fact and law"

« une question faisant intervenir des éléments à la fois de droit et de fait » (Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons, 2014, para 23)

Common misconceptions

stateless persons ↔ refugees stateless persons ↔ migrants stateless persons ↔ foreigners

stateless persons ↔ undocumented persons

"A mixed question of fact and law"

Gaps in the law

> Problems with the procedures

Gaps in the law

- > Attribution of citizenship at independence
- > Gender discrimination
- > Weak rights attached to birth in the country
 - > even if otherwise stateless
- > No provision for children of unknown parents & birthplace
- > No provision for orphaned or adopted children
- > Racial, ethnic, religious discrimination
- > Restrictions on transmission for those born abroad
- > Restrictions on transmission by naturalised citizens
- ➤ Naturalisation very difficult to access

Legal gaps for prevention of childhood statelessness in Great Lakes Region

- > Child of unknown parents:
 - ➤ Provision exists: Angola, Burundi, CAR, Congo Rep, DRC, Kenya, Rwanda, South Sudan, Sudan, Uganda, Zambia
 - ➤ No provision: Tanzania
- Child who cannot acquire nationality of parents
 - ➤ Provision exists: Angola, DRC, Rwanda
 - ➤ No provision: Burundi, CAR, Congo Rep, Kenya, South Sudan, Sudan, Tanzania, Uganda, Zambia
- ➤ Gender discrimination: Burundi, Sudan (& others to lesser extent)

Problems with the procedures

- Civil law vs common law heritage
- ➤ Importance of **adjudication systems**: due process, (para)legal assistance, reasoned decisions & effective appeal to a court
- > Birth registration & possibility of other forms of evidence
- > Requirement for consular registration of births outside the country
- > Family codes & proof of descent if birth out of wedlock
- > Child protection systems (abandoned infants, orphans, street kids)
- > Vetting systems & burden of proof for issue of ID cards & passports
- > Lack of a document that is conclusive proof of nationality
- Official and unofficial costs

Birth registration

	% birth registration U5 y.o. / % in possession of birth certificate	
Angola	25 / 13	(DHS 2015-16)
Burundi	84 / 66	(DHS 2016-17)
CAR	61/?	(MICS 2010)
Congo Rep.	92 / 84	(DHS 2011-12)
DR Congo	25 / 14	(DHS 2013-14)
Kenya	67 / 24	(DHS 2014)
Rwanda	56/3	(DHS 2014-15)
South Sudan	35 / 10	(MICS 2010)
Sudan	67 / ?	(MICS 2014)
Tanzania	26 / 14	(DHS 2015-16)
Uganda	32 / 20	(DHS 2016)
Zambia	12 / 4	(DHS 2013-14)

Taxonomy of statelessness

➤ Migrants and their descendants

- > Pre-independence migrants (eg Makonde in Kenya)
- > Undocumented & stranded contemporary migrants (incl. in detention)
- > "Returnees" to a country of origin (eg deportees from Europe, Israel)
- > Asylum seekers, refugees & former refugees (Angola, Liberia, SL, Rwanda)

> Cross border populations

- > Communities divided by international borders or where borders contested
- Nomads / pastoralists

> Vulnerable children (who become adults)

➤ Undocumented foreign parents, born out of wedlock, abandoned infants, orphans, street children, trafficked ...

Solutions



- ➤ Persons of undetermined nationality living in their "own country"
 - ➤ Confirmation of nationality
 - > Facilitated acquisition of nationality

- >Stateless migrants
 - ➤ Confirmation or acquisition of nationality of country "of origin"
 - >Protection as a stateless person, with facilitated naturalisation

Solutions: law reforms

- ➤ End discrimination based on gender & birth in/out of wedlock
- Measures to ensure statelessness not created by presumptions based on ethnic group
- Child protection
 - > Unknown or stateless parents or cannot obtain nationality of parents
 - ➤ Adopted (formal and informal)
 - ➤ Children incl. with parents' naturalisation
- >Strengthen rights to acquire based on birth & residence
- > Strengthen judicial oversight of executive decisions
- ➤ Nationality/statelessness determination procedures

Solutions: procedural reforms

- Universal birth registration
- > Child protection: children separated from parents
- > Clarity on requirements to acquire ID document/passport
- ➤ Burden of proof shared: if a person holds a document recognising nationality for the state to show not valid
- > Document that is proof of citizenship (nationality certificate)
- > Facilitated naturalisation in appropriate cases
- ➤ Outreach to nomadic pastoralists & border populations
- > Strengthened consular registration
- > Inter-state collaboration to resolve undetermined nationality

Regional cooperation

is badly needed...

- >Integration with AU freedom of movement agenda
- > Harmonisation of laws to facilitate understanding
- ➤ Bi- & multi-lateral commissions to determine nationality
- > Regional standard-setting on state obligations