Cash-based Intervention Technical Working Group
Turkey

CBI TWG Monthly Meeting Minute

9 December 2019

Chaired by                Ahmet Unver (UNHCR), Hiba Hanano (WFP)
Venue:                  UNHCR Yıldız Kule Office (Ankara), UN House (Gaziantep), WFP IAO (Istanbul)
Participants:

Ankara
Livio Mercurio (UNHCR), Aynur Seda Baran (UNICEF), Ali Muhtaroulı (ASAM), Cansu Şengür (ASAM), Cemile Altuntaş (ASAM), Ayman Sallawy Alhab (TRC), Fatih Aper Akalin (TRC), Görkem Göker (TRC), Alperen Açıkol (TRC)

Gaziantep
Ahmet Unver (UNHCR), Hiba Hanano (WFP), Faruk Acar (WFP), Gözde Gulgün (WFP), Berçin Doğan (WFP), Mohamed Ameen (IOM), M. Anwar Kattan (AlSham), Osama Alsapti (AAMS), Fatma Hannura (AAMS)

Istanbul
Arzum Karasu (WFP)

Agenda:

Welcome & Review of Agenda
1) CaLP Amman Coordination Workshop Highlights
2) Emergency Cash Decision Tree
3) CBI Programs in Turkey 2019
4) Thematic Focus: Minimum Expenditure Basket
5) Q&A
6) AOB

Action Points - Follow up Issues and Updates:
✓ As of next meeting donors will be invited to participate.

New Action Points from the Meeting:
✓ Members review the CBI mapping survey and share their comments => COB 13 January 2020

Welcome and Action Points from Previous Meeting:

1. CaLP Amman Coordination Workshop Highlights

The meeting aimed:
• To review the draft cash coordination tip sheet and revise content in what better fits the Basic Needs programming in the region.
• To support peer to peer learning between coordination actors; to explore some key themes that are affecting the delivery of CVA in the region.

The tip sheet provides guidance on critical issues in cash coordination such as:
• Where cash coordination, and CWGs, fit in the humanitarian system.
• How to effectively set up, lead and manage a CWG.
• What are the key activities of CWG coordinators and CWGs.
• Key considerations i.e: good practices and tips for effective coordination, with an emphasis on
• MPC/multi-sector programming
2. **Emergency Cash Decision Tree:**
   a. **Mapping of Cash Based Assistance in Turkey:**
      - 18 organisations appealed through 32 different programmes.
      - Total used budget adds up to 746,282,635 reaching 1.9 beneficiaries.
      - Most of the operations are located in South East Turkey and Marmara region.
   
   b. **Emergency Cash Decision Tree:**
      - The document can be accessed through this link.

3. **CBI Programs in Turkey 2019**
   **Reached Beneficiaries:**
   - Cash programmes are highly reached by WFP and TRC with the ESSN programme with a total of 1,823,425 beneficiaries.
   - UNICEF comes next with their CCTE programme with a total of 525,928 beneficiaries.
   - UNHCR come third with their support to people moving out of camps with a total of 103,681 beneficiaries.
   - WHH, ATAA, IOM, SASF, ASAM, HRDF, MSYD, CONCERN WW, DRC, IBC, MAVI KALEM and STL.

   **CBI Beneficiaries segregated by indicators:**
   - A total of 1,732,817 are benefitting from monthly cash transfers.
   - A total of 526,360 are benefitting from conditional cash transfers.
   - A total of 200,819 have benefited from one-time cash transfers.
   - A total of 90,608 are receiving cash for food in TACs.

   **CBI Beneficiaries segregated by sector:**
   - 2,024,244 are receiving support through Basic Needs sector.
   - 526,360 are receiving support through Education sector.
   - 9,605 are receiving support through protection and 396 through livelihoods.

   **CBI Mapping Survey and Analysis 2020:**
   - Data gathered through ActivityInfo provides an analysis of total CBI programs per sector.
   - Due to the content of collected data through ActivityInfo, an analysis of CBI programs in Turkey, which may provide information on modality, beneficiaries, transfer amounts etc, can be accessed through CBI Mapping.
   - CBI TWG commits to do a CBI Mapping exercise. Previous survey is presented to members, and initial comments were received.
   - Draft survey will be share with members and feedback will be collected COB 13 January 2020.

4. **Thematic Focus: Minimum Expenditure Basket**
   **The Economic Overview in 2019**
   - By Q4 2018 the growth rate dropped from (+7.4) in Q1 to (-2.8) in Q4.
   - In 2019 the growth rate healed to reach (+0.9) by Q4.
   - Although the economy started to recover in Q3 2019, unemployment rate is still high.
   - The Manufacturing and Construction fields are the most affected, and unfortunately those are the fields most referred to by refugees.
   - USD is around 5.74 TRY as of November 2019, foreign trade volume is recovering.
   - Currency rate affects the foreign trade, foreign trade affects production and employment.
   - Turkey’s industry relies on imported intermediate goods by %65 in 2007 (%62 excluding oil).
   - Decrease in import affects production, and in turn leads to unemployment.
• The import coverage ratio of exports increased from 75.6% to 89.3% (November 2018/2019).
• Current slight increase in imports is promising for economic recovery.
• Energy prices are increasing, affecting both production costs and consumption.
• Annual inflation had a decreasing trend across 2019, but it increased in November and reached at 10.56%.

The Impact of the Economy on Refugees

• Constructing a Minimum Expenditure Basket (MEB):
  o First contents are selected by choosing commodities and quantities from TUIK prices lists.
  o Then differences are quantified TUIK Vs Refugees where a comparison is carried between the total expenditure of non-poor HH in ESSN data sets with TUIK MEB total.
  o Last step is to track prices, where TUIK data quarterly are extracted to track price changes of MEB. This helps to reduce price using calculated deflation factor.
  o The food basket is chosen on a study of three layers: 1) the basket has to give a total of 2100 KCL per person per day 2) the nutritional value of the basket has to be divided in accordance to the nutritional needs of iron, carbohydrate, oil (omega 3), iodine .. etc 3) The items are selected based on variety of data sources and consultation from other stakeholders.
  o Before selection, WFP ensures that they balance between the expenditure-based and rights-based approaches.
  o Three components play a great role in setting the food basket, Availability, Accessibility and Utilization.
• Staple food prices continue to increase, effects of campaign (declared by Turkish Government in Q4 2018) in Q4 2019 fading away.
• Minimum Expenditure Basket costs 358 TRY in November 2019, ESSN covers 41%.

The Refugees in the Southeast

• Metropolitan areas are more expensive than average, highest price rise in the Southeast. But South East cities were more affected with the inflation as increase was higher in those cities

Highlights

• The Turkish economy has started to recover; there is a 0.9% increase in growth rate in Q3 2019, yet unemployment is still high.
• The inflation rates were going down, yet in November it was as high as 10.5%
• Minimum Expenditure Basket cost is 358 TRY in November, and ESSN covers 41% of it.
• MEB is calculated for 6 people households, corresponding the demographics of the refugees in Turkey
• Food basket offers a nutritionally balanced diet that of the minimum cost, based on the consumption habits of the refugees
• The MEB costs are less in the Southeast, yet, the inflation rates are relatively higher

Implications

• The contraction in 2018 in the Turkish economy negatively affected both the Turkish and Refugees
• High unemployment rates bring along job competition between Turkish and refugee communities, and possible tension
• Deteriorated purchasing power makes the refugees more assistance-reliant, increased transfer value aims to alleviate
• The employment opportunities are limited in winter, so are costs are higher due to heating – further assistance needed

6. Questions & Answers

• Crisis Assessments: Any design of a programme is highly dependent on data. So before any implementation a rapid assessment is carried and then compared to data that is collected by the hosted country anti- crises with any additional available data.
• MEB calculation are not only used by WFP in Turkey and is available for the use of others. For instance UNHCR uses MEB in CBI programming.

• Quarterly Top ups:
WFP calculates on monthly basis the minimum cost of living for refugees based on the commodity and service prices that are included in the basket. The sum of ESSN contribution and income generated by refugees is what refugee households have to meet their basic need. Any difference between this sum and the basket cost is considered as a gap to meet basic needs. Having a gap means there is a need for further assistance, and this can imply the time to advocate for increase in transfer value.

• In general, all the macroeconomic indicators are linked to each other. In Turkey’s case for example production heavily depends on import and employment has a strict correlation with production. So any changes in these indicators might have a positive or negative impact on the other including unemployment.

• Every month WFP extracts price data from TUIK and calculates the minimum expenditure basket cost. However, two important adjustments are made in the calculation: first WFP takes into account the regional price differences and second, considers the difference between Turkish population and refugee population in terms of purchasing patterns and behaviours.

• Minimum Expenditure Basket costs 358 TRY (November 2019). This is calculated by extracting data from TUIK not from specific shops then adjusted to refugee population.

5. AOB
• Next Meeting is scheduled on Cash Protection January 2020