

ESSN Task Force Istanbul Meeting Minutes

Agenda	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome and introduction • Action points from the previous meeting • Updates on the ESSN <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ August 2018 Focus Group Discussions findings ▪ TRC Outreach Activities • Updates on the CCTE • Discussion on Challenges / Barriers • AOB 		
Date of meeting	8 October 2018 09:30 - 11:30	Location	TRC Area Office - Zafer Mah. Çınar Sok. No: 1 Kat:1 A5 Adapark Plaza (Yenibosna) Bahcelievler / Istanbul
Meeting Co-Chairs	Arzum Karasu (WFP) Ayman Alhalb (TRC)		

1. Action points:

Follow up issue:	Who will take action:	Deadline:
Detailed information on the HH verification numbers	TRC requested from MoFLSS	Pending for TRC to receive info from MoFLSS
LLE report to be translated into Arabic	ESSN TF Co-Chairs	Pending upon discussion regarding budget approval
LLE report Turkish version to send to all partners	ESSN TF Co-Chairs	Pending – translation on going
Share FGD ESSN, livelihoods related findings to all partners after October TF	ESSN TF Co-Chairs	Done

2. Updates on the ESSN:

- The Co-Chairs World Food Programme (WFP) and Turkish Red Crescent (TRC) provided an update of the ESSN to date noting that as of 3 October 2018, a total of 470,043 applications (2,383,349 people) were registered; 3,113 applications were not assessed, 250,587 applications were deemed eligible and 216,343 applications were ineligible. 37.19% of the applications were registered by TRC Service Centres.
 - 250,587 households (1,460,897 people) in total received ESSN assistance in September.
 - 36,260 households (212,993 people) in Istanbul received the ESSN assistance.
 - As of 10 September, 1,454 accounts were swept back nationwide: 718 uncollected cards (+3 months), 736 dormant accounts (+6 months)
- **Focus Group Discussions findings:**
 - August Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) investigated the relationship between gender and livelihoods as it relates to family dynamics of refugees in Turkey. The questionnaire for the month was comprised of four sections: 1) Division of responsibilities in households; 2) Work conditions; 3) Perceptions of working women; 4) Assistance for work.
 - Highlights:
 - Women were often reported to be responsible for official processes in Turkey whereas in Syria such responsibilities belonged to male adding they do not feel comfortable with their additional roles.
 - The majority of female participants expressed that they wished to work from home because they had to take care of their children and attend to other household responsibilities adding they would prefer not to work if their families could meet their financial needs.
 - Participants often stated that vocational trainings providing certification could equip them with the skills to access formal jobs, receive equal wages, enjoy equal working conditions, and lower the chances of discrimination based on nationality.
 - **TRC Outreach Activities:**

During September, TRC Istanbul Outreach teams have visited 140 sites in 4 provinces out of 11. 25 advocacy visits mainly within SASF's and 61 Muhtar visits in total for Istanbul.

• **TRC-WFP Monitoring and Evaluation Activities:**

In addition to the on-site monitoring in Istanbul, Bursa, Aydin, Kocaeli, Tekirdağ, Balıkesir and Çanakkale; 1 CVME has been conducted in Canakkale and a total of 5 FGDs sessions (3 in Istanbul, 1 in Balıkesir and 1 in Canakkale with 2 females and 2 male groups and 1 mixed group). The target audience was non-Syrians refugees.

Below are the findings specific to the Marmara Region:

- Hospitals: Hospitals in Bursa reported that some beneficiaries who already owned a Disability Health Report (DHR) took appointments at different hospital hoping to receive a higher disability ratio. Most of hospitals visited in the Marmara Region declared that the number of appointments for DHR has shown an increase since it was declared that an additional payment would be available as of August 2018.
- SASFs: The majority of SASFs have finished updating DHR registration before the due date, 25 September. Those who required additional staff assistance to finish were supported by TRC M&E assistants.
- FGDs: September's topic was about Vocational Trainings. Because capabilities and skills vary among nationalities, FGD groups were classified this month as Syrian and non-Syrian (Afghans, Iraqis, Somalians, etc.)

3. **Updates on the CCTE:**

- 328.036 beneficiaries received CCTE payment and additional payment. 13.446 beneficiaries received only additional payment. 170.823 cards were uploaded for September 2018. Cumulative CCTE beneficiaries as of September 2018 payment: 376.326 children reached (with at least one CCTE Payment). 190.059 number of Kızılaycards have been uploaded with payment.
- 22 SASFs and 8 Halkbank branches have been visited in 6 provinces in the Marmara Region since 10 September 2018.
- In Istanbul and Çanakkale, reports of issues with school registrations have been noted both through field visits and also SASFs and NGOs informing Field Monitor. Issues such as schools rejecting registration have been reported to MoNE.
- SASFs reported that lately beneficiary addresses disappear from ISAIS. This is possibly due to DGMM verification program. The ratio of CCTE beneficiaries not being able to receive payment due to this might reduce until the addresses re-appear within two months as the CCTE payments are done bi-monthly, nevertheless, beneficiaries should be urged to always keep their addresses updated with the Population Bureau.
- Regarding transportation: PECs will be able to provide transportation to the districts within the 20km radius of the PEC. However, transportation also depends on the number of children coming from other districts.
- There is no child protection component specific to the ALP program. However, if an ALP student is also a CCTE beneficiary and do not continue the program on a regular basis the family could be visited by the TRC CP teams if there is a team in the province. Because information of this student will be included in the rejection file shared by the Ministry.

4. **Open discussion: Challenges and Barriers:**

- Prior to the presentation, participants were asked to think of 'any key barriers for ESSN applications in the region of Marmara' they had come across or heard. Some examples such as; registration issues, inconsistent approaches at institutional level and child marriages were suggested as examples and introductory elements.
- Participants agreed on those examples in particular with the registration and inconsistent approaches from the governmental institutions points; Examples of cases were shared i.e., applications to the ESSN program impossible due to registration issues. Questions as to the possibility of updating the ESSN application criteria were raised 'in order to avoid leaving out needy families who do not fulfil the criteria but yet would need assistance'. The TRC and WFP Co-Chairs feedback focused on the existence of local social allowance as well as specific packages and that in addition to those, the existing referral system allowed some cases to be taken care for by related NGOs and/or institutions when referred to them.
- UNICEF representative raised an issue as to an SASF requesting applicants to provide a statement from their bank testifying whether they own any assets or not. This is the first time this issue was shared so far.
- Some attendees raised questions about facts and figures presented during the presentation. The discussion part was rather dynamic and interactive. One NGO - Dogu Turkistan Genclik ve Kultur Dernegi - asked for assistance claiming 'that ESSN seemed to be focused on helping Syrians mainly leaving out other potential beneficiaries'

giving examples of rejection of applications in some given areas. WFP and TRC Co-Chairs agreed on meeting soon to get more detail and look at ways to unblock the situation if needed.

- TRC outreach team has established an e-mail address; kizilaykartdiserisim@kizilay.org.tr. This email can be used by partners and NGOs as well as institutions to refer cases in regards to the ESSN application process.
- Caritas representative reported that Kagithane and Eyup SASF offices do not provide CCTE to non-ESSN beneficiaries (Ineligibles). UNICEF CCTE Field Monitor commented that Kağithane SASF had been visited twice by UNICEF and also phone communication had been established. The SASF in Kağithane is well informed about the CCTE eligibility criteria. Eyup SASF on the other hand had been visited before, the same problem had been identified and reported. UNICEF and Caritas representatives agreed to monitor Kağithane and Eyüp issues and inform MoNE in the future. Most of the NGOs declared that they are facing problems with Eyup SASF, WFP said they were following the cases in Eyup SASF with TRC and they have it on this week's plan.
- Low application rate issues in Kirklareli has been raised asking for clarifications; WFP stated this was due to a number of Syrians whose ID were not being verified yet by the DGMM primarily due to the fact that Kirklareli used to be a transit point to Europe.
- An ECHO representative wondered whether the number of beneficiaries will stop raising at some point. WFP and TRC answered this depended upon many factors such as new families getting IDs, changing demographic criteria, DHR reports and such adding that some provinces had a rather stable statistic compared to big cities.
- It was stated that after the DGMM verification was over in some provinces, some IDs (TP holders) were deactivated following a non-show up wondering how this would affect the beneficiary numbers giving the example of the province of Aydin where three thousand IDs were deactivated. WFP clarified that the verification aims at defining the number of people living in x province/district and that those who do not show up are not living there and thus their ID are deactivated like it is the case in Edirne or Aydin. But on the other hand, it can also be a source of misunderstanding since like in the example of the province of Kocaeli, about eight thousand TP ID were deactivated realising after a few months that these numbers were actually accurate since the number of TPs had risen in the time being.

5. AOB:

- Please remember to send any issues/challenges observed with as much detail as possible (location, date, etc.) to the ESSN TF focal points Arzum Karasu (arzum.karasu@wfp.org) and Ayman Alhalb (ayman.alhalb@kizilay.org.tr).
- The next meeting will be held on **12 November (TBC)**. The venue, time and agenda will be shared accordingly.

Attachments:

1. ESSN Task Force Istanbul Presentation
2. Presentation of CCTE updates
3. August 2018 Focus Group Discussion Report